

Malunkhyaputta Sutta

“Advice to Venerable Malunkhyaputta”

From:
MAJJHIMA NIKAYA

I heard thus.

At one time the Blessed One was living in the monastery offered by Anathapindika in Jet's grove in Savatthi. When venerable Malunkhyaputta was in his seclusion this thought occurred to him These views are unexplained, put aside by the Blessed One: Is the world eternal or not eternal, is it limited or unlimited? Is the soul and body the same, is the soul different from the body? Is the Thus Gone One after death. Isn't the Thus Gone One after death? Or is it the Thus Gone One is and isn't after death? Or the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death? I do not like these things unexplained by the Blessed One. If the Blessed One explains them, I will lead the holy life under him, or else I will give up robes. These were the thoughts and discursive thoughts that occurred to venerable Malunkhyaputta in his seclusion

Then venerable Malunkhyaputta got up from his seclusion, approached the Blessed One, worshipped and sat on a side and said, ‘Venerable sir, in my seclusion this thought occurred to me These views are unexplained and put aside by the Blessed One: Is the world eternal or not? Is it limited or unlimited, Is the soul and body the same, or is the soul different from the body? Is the Thus Gone One after death? Isn't the Thus Gone One after death? Or is it, the Thus Gone One is and isn't after death? Or is it, the Thus Gone One neither is nor is not after death? I do not like these things unexplained by the Blessed One. If the Blessed One explains them, to me, I will lead the holy life, otherwise I will give up robes: If the Blessed One knows the world is eternal, may the Blessed One declare the world is eternal. If the Blessed One knows, the world is not eternal may the Blessed One declare the world is not eternal. If the Blessed One does not know whether the world is eternal or not eternal, he should be straightforward and say I do not know and see this. : If the Blessed One knows the world is limited, may the Blessed One declare the world is limited. If the Blessed One knows the world is not limited, may the Blessed One declare the world is not limited. If the Blessed One does not know whether the world is limited or not limited he should be straightforward and say I do not know and see this. : If the Blessed One knows whether the soul and body is the same. May the Blessed One declare the soul and body is the same. If the Blessed One knows, the soul is different from the body, may the Blessed One declare the soul is different from the body If the Blessed One does not know whether the soul and body is the same or the soul is different from body. He should be straightforward and say I do not know and see this. If the Blessed One knows the Thus Gone One is after death, may the Blessed One declare the Thus Gone One is after death. If the Blessed One knows The Thus Gone One is not after death, may the Blessed One declare, the Thus Gone One is not after death If the Blessed One does not know whether the Thus Gone One is after death or the Thus Gone One is not after death. Should be straightforward and say, I do not know and see this. : If the Blessed One knows the Thus Gone One is not after death, may the Blessed One declare the Thus Gone One is not after death. If the Blessed One does not know, The Thus Gone One is, or is not after death, should be straightforward and say I do not know and see this. If the Blessed One knows the Thus Gone One is, and is not after death, may the Blessed One declare the Thus Gone One is, and is not after death. If the Blessed One does not know The Thus Gone One neither is nor is not after death, may the Blessed One declare, the Thus Gone One neither is nor is not after death. If the Blessed One does not know whether the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death or the Thus Gone One neither is not or is not, not that after death, he should be straightforward and say I do not know and see this:

Malunkhyaputta, did I tell you, Come Malunkhyaputta lead the holy life in my dispensation I will declare to you, whether the world is eternal or not eternal The Thus Gone One neither is not or is not, not that after death.? No, venerable sir. Then did you tell me, venerable sir, I will lead the holy life in your dispensation if you declare to me whether the world is eternal or not? The Thus Gone One neither is not, nor is not that, after death? No, venerable sir. Malunkhyaputta, I did not ask you to lead the holy life in my dispensation, with a promise to declare to you whether the world is eternal or not eternal and the thus Gone One neither is not or is not, not that after death and you did not tell me venerable sir, I will lead the holy life in your dispensation if you declare to me whether the world is eternal or not eternal and The Thus Gone One neither is not nor is not, not that after death. When this is so, what is the reason to give up robes?

Malunkhyaputta, if some one were to say I will not lead the holy life in the dispensation of the Blessed One until it is declared to me whether the world is eternal or not and the Thus Gone One neither is not nor is not, not that after death. Those things would never be declared by the Thus Gone One, and that person would die. It is like a man shot with a poisoned arrow, and his friends, co-associates and blood relations would call a surgeon to attend on him. He would say, I will not pull out this arrow until I know, the one who shot this arrow is of warrior, brahmin, householder or out castes' clan. I will not pull out this arrow until, I knew, the name and family of the one who shot this arrow. I will not pull out this arrow until, I knew whether the one who shot this arrow is short or tall or of middling size. I will not pull out, this arrow until, I knew whether the one who shot this arrow is dark, or fair or tan. I will not pull out this arrow until, I knew the town, village or the hamlet from which he came. I will not pull out this arrow until, I knew the kind of bow used, I will not pull out the arrow until, I knew the kind of string used for the bow. I will not pull out this arrow until, I knew the kind of shaft used to shoot. Malunkhyaputta, this man will die before he knew all this In the same manner, Malunkhyaputta, if anyone was to say I will not lead the holy life in the dispensation of the Blessed One until, it is declared to me whether the world is eternal or not and The Thus Gone One neither is not nor is not, not that after death..Those things will never be declared by the Thus Gone One, and that person will die.

Malunkhyaputta, with the view, the world is eternal, a holy life is not lead, even with the view the world is not eternal, a holy life is not lead. Malunkhyaputta, with the view the world is eternal or even the world is not eternal, there is birth, decay, death, grief, lament, unpleasantness and displeasure, I declare he is destroyed here and now. Malunkhyaputta, with the view, the world is limited, a holy life is not lead, even with the view the world is not limited, a holy life is not lead. Malunkhyaputta, with the view the world is limited or even the world is not limited, there is birth, decay, death, grief, lament, unpleasantness and displeasure, I declare he is destroyed here and now. Malunkhyaputta, with the view, the soul and body is the same, a holy life is not lead, even with the view the soul is different from the body, a holy life is not lead.

Malunkhyaputta, with the view, the soul and body is the same or even with the view the soul is different from the body, there is birth, decay, death, grief, lament, unpleasantness and displeasure, I declare he is destroyed here and now.

Malunkhyaputta, with the view, the Thus Gone One is, after death, a holy life is not lead. Even with the view the Thus Gone One is not after death, a holy life is not lead. Malunkhyaputta, with the view the Thus Gone One is after death or even the view the Thus Gone One is not after death, there is birth, decay, death, grief, lament, unpleasantness and distress. I declare he is destroyed here and now Malunkhyaputta, with the view, the Thus Gone One is and is not after death, a holy life is not lead. Even with the view the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death. A holy life is not lead. Malunkhyaputta, with the view the Thus Gone One is and is not after death or even the view the Thus Gone One neither is nor is not after death, there is birth, decay, death, grief, lament, unpleasantness and distress. I declare he is destroyed here and now.

Therefore Malunkhyaputta, bear the undeclared as undeclared. Malunkhyaputta, what are the not declared? The world is eternal, is not declared by me. The world is not eternal, is limited, is not limited. The soul and body are the same. The soul is different from the body. The Thus Gone One is, after death. The Thus Gone One, is not after death. The Thus Gone One is and is not after death. The Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death, are not declared by me. Malunkhyaputta, why are these not declared by me? They are not the essential for the principles of the holy life, they do not lead to turning away, to detachment, to cessation, to appeasement, to realisation, to enlightenment and to extinction. Malunkhyaputta, what are the declared by me? This, is unpleasant, is declared. This, is its arising, is declared. This, is its cessation is declared. This is the path to its cessation, is declared. Malunkhyaputta, why are these declared by me? These are the essentials for the principles of the holy life, they lead to turning away, to detachment, to cessation, to appeasement, to realisation, to enlightenment and to extinction. Malunkhyaputta, I declare them. Bear the undeclared as undeclared and the declared as declared.

The Blessed One said thus and venerable Malunkhyaputta delighted in the words of the Blessed One....

Vacchagotta Sutta

“Advice to Vacchagotta”

from

MAJJHIMA NIKAYA

I heard thus.

At one time the Blessed One was living in the monastery offered by Anathapindika in Jeta's grove in Savatthi. Then the wandering ascetic Vacchagotta approached the Blessed One exchanged friendly greetings, sat on a side and said to the Blessed One.

‘Good Gotama, the world is eternal this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the world is eternal, this only is the truth all else is false’. ‘Good Gotama, the world is not eternal, this only is the truth and all else is false Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the world is not eternal, this only is the truth all else is false’. ‘Good Gotama, the world is limited, this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the world is limited, this only is the truth all else is false.’ ‘Good Gotama, the world is not-limited, this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the world is not limited, this only is the truth all else is false’. ‘Good Gotama, the soul is the body, this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the soul is the body, this only is the truth all else is false.’ ‘Good Gotama, the soul is different from the body, this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the soul is different from the body, this only is the truth all else is false.’ ‘Good Gotama, the Thus Gone One is after death- this only is the truth all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the Thus Gone One is after death, this only is the truth all else is false.’ ‘Good Gotama, the Thus Gone One is not after death, this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the Thus Gone One is not after death, this only is the truth all else is false.’ ‘Good Gotama, the Thus Gone One is, and is not, after death, this only is the truth, all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view.’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the Thus Gone One is, and is not after death, this only is the truth all else is false.’ ‘Good Gotama, the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death, this only is the truth and all else is false. Does good Gotama hold this view?’ ‘No, Vaccha, I'm not of that view, the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death, this only is the truth all else is false.’

‘Good Gotama, when asked, is good Gotama of the view, the world is eternal, this only is the truth, all else is false, it was said you were not of that view. When asked, is good Gotama of the view, the world is not eternal, this only is the truth, all else is false, it was said, you were not of that view. When asked, is good Gotama of the view, the world is limited, this only is the truth, all else is false, it was said you were not of that view. When asked, is good Gotama of the view, the world is not limited, this only is the truth, all else is false, it was said you were not of that view. When asked, is good Gotama of the view, the Thus Gone One is and is not after death, this only is the truth, all else is false, it was said you were not of that view. When asked, is good Gotama of the view, the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death, this only is the truth, all else is false, it was said you were not of that view. Good Gotama, seeing what danger has thrown out all these views?’

‘Vaccha, the view, the world is eternal, is a bond of views, is a speculation in views, it is with unpleasantness, with trouble, with burning, not leading to giving up, to detachment, to appeasement, to knowledge, to

enlightenment, to cessation and to extinction. The view the world is not eternal,--re - The world is limited,-re- the world is not limited .re..the soul is the body..re..the soul is different from the body, .re.. the Thus Gone One is, after death, .re..the Thus Gone One is not, after death,-re -the Thus Gone One is and is not after death...re.. the Thus Gone One neither is, nor is not after death is a bond of views, is a speculation in views, it is with unpleasantness, with trouble, with burning, not leading to giving up, to detachment, to appeasement, to knowledge, to enlightenment, to cessation and to extinction. Vaccha, seeing these dangers I have thrown out all these views.’ ‘Does good Gotama hold any other view?’

‘Vaccha, The Thus Gone One has overcome views. This is the view of the Thus Gone One. This is matter, this is the arising of matter, and this is the fading of matter. This is feeling, this is the arising of feelings and this is the fading of feelings. This is perception, this is the arising of perceptions and this is the fading of perceptions. These are determinations, this is the arising of determinations and this, the fading of determinations. This is consciousness, this is the arising of consciousness and this is fading of consciousness. Therefore, I say the Thus Gone One has destroyed, is detached, has given up and is released, from all imaginings, recollections, and all latent tendencies of me and mine.’

‘Good Gotama, where is the thus released mind born?’ ‘Vaccha, is born does not apply.’ ‘Then good Gotama, is he not born?’ ‘Vaccha, is not born does not apply.’ ‘Gotama, is he born and not born?’ ‘Vaccha, is born and is not born does not apply.’ ‘Then Gotama, is he neither born, nor not born?’ ‘Vaccha, is neither born, nor is not born, is not applicable..’

‘When asked where is the thus released mind born, it was said, is born does not apply. When asked is it not born, it was said not born does not apply. When asked is it born and not born, it was said, born and not born does not apply. When asked, is it neither born, nor is not born, it was said neither born nor not born, does not apply. Good Gotama, in this I am completely ignorant and deluded. Whatever little understanding I had with the earlier conversation, has now vanished.’

‘Vaccha, your ignorance and delusion is nothing strange. This is deep, difficult to understand peaceful and exalted, not for logical thinking. Is clever and should be experienced by the wise. By one of another sect like you, with some other liking, without being yoked in it and living in it, it cannot be understood. So then Vaccha, I will question you, on this and you may reply as it pleases you. There is a fire burning in front of you, would you know, there is a fire burning in front of me?’ ‘Good Gotama, if a fire burns in front of me, I would know, there’s a fire burning in front of me.’ ‘Vaccha, if you were asked, this fire burning in front of you, on account of what is it burning, how would you reply?’ ‘Good Gotama, if I was asked, this fire burning in front of you, on account of what is it burning, I would reply, this fire burning in front of me is burning on account of grass and sticks.’ ‘Vaccha, if the fire in front of you extinguishes, would you know, this fire in front of me has extinguished?’ ‘Good Gotama, if the fire in front of me extinguishes, I would know, this fire has extinguished.’ ‘Vaccha, if you were asked, this fire that has extinguished in which direction did it go, to the east, west, north or south?’ ‘Good, Gotama, it does not apply. That fire burnt on account of grass and sticks, those supports finished, no other supports were supplied, without supports the fire, went out.’

‘Vaccha, in that same manner, the matter with which the Thus Gone One is pointed out, is dispelled, uprooted, made a palm stump, made a thing not to grow again: Vaccha, the Thus Gone One is released from the reckonings of matter. It is deep, difficult to fathom, like the great ocean. Is born, does not apply, is not born does not apply. Is born and is not born does not apply, neither is born, nor is not born does not apply. The feelings, with which the Thus Gone One is pointed, are dispelled, uprooted, made palm stumps made things not to grow again: Vaccha, the Thus Gone One is released from the reckonings of feelings. It is deep, difficult to fathom, like the great ocean. Is born does not apply, is not born does not apply. Is born and is not born does not apply. Neither is born nor is not born does not apply. The perceptions, with which the Thus Gone One is pointed are dispelled, uprooted, made palm stumps, made things not to grow again. Vaccha, the Thus Gone One is released from the reckonings of perceptions. It is deep, difficult to fathom, like the great ocean. Is born does not apply, is not born does not apply, is born and is not born does not apply. Neither is born nor is not born does not apply. The determinations with which the Thus Gone One is pointed out, are dispelled, uprooted, made palm stumps, made things not to grow again: Vaccha, the Thus Gone One is released from the reckonings of determinations. It is deep, difficult to fathom like the great ocean. Is born does not apply, is not born does not apply Is born and is not born does not apply. Neither is born nor is not born does not apply. The consciousness with which the Thus Gone One is pointed out, is dispelled, uprooted, made a palm stump, made a thing not to grow again. Vaccha, the Thus Gone One is released from the reckonings of consciousness. It is deep, difficult to fathom like the great ocean. Is born does not apply, is not born does not apply. Is born and is not born does not apply. Neither is born nor is not born does not apply.’

When this was said the wandering ascetic Vacchagotta said thus to the Blessed One, close to the village or hamlet, there is a huge Sala tree, because of impermanence, its leaves, branches, bark, shoots and sapwood fall off and is left with only the heartwood. In the same manner, on account of the words of good Gotama, with myleaves and branches pulled out, shoots pulled out, the bark removed, the sap removed, I stand as the pure heartwood. I understand good Gotama, it is as though something over turned is reinstalled, something covered is made manifest. As though the path is shown to someone who had lost his way. As though an oil lamp is lighted,

for those who have sight to see forms in the dark. Now, I take refuge in good Gotama, in the Teaching, in the Community of bhikkhus. May the Blessed One bear me as a lay disciple who has taken refuge from today until life lasts.